

GOMAL UNIVERSITY JOURNAL OF RESEARCH

Gomal University, Dera Ismail Khan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan ISSN:1019-8180 (Print) ISSN: 2708-1737 (Online)



www.gujr.com.pk **HEC Recognized** CrossRef

PERCEPTIONS OF TEACHERS ON GOVERNMENT SCHOOL PRIVATIZATION IN PUNJAB, PAKISTAN

Ayesha Kanwal¹, Farrukh Kamran² & Shahid Rafiq³

¹Associate Tutor, School of Education, University of Glasgow, UNITED KINGDOM ²Lecturer, Department of Education, University of Baltistan Skardu, KP, Pakistan ³Manager Outcome Based Education, University of Central Puniab, Lahore, Pakistan

KEYWORDS	ABSTRACT
Educational Privatization, Job Security, Salaries, Job Satisfaction, Government Schools	The educational privatization is the global phenomenon with far-reaching implications, and its impact on teachers in government schools within the context of Punjab, Pakistan, is a subject of dominant importance. Research investigates the effects of privatization upon teachers' job security, salaries, and job satisfaction. Study includes a mixed-methods approach, combining
Article History	survey data from 430 teachers with in-depth interviews of 25 teachers. The results reveal that educational privatization in Punjab presents uncertainties
Date of Submission: 24-11-2023 Date of Acceptance: 26-12-2023 Date of Publication: 31-12-2023	about teachers' job security and contractual terms, reduces their autonomy and creates financial stress. Thus, on the positive side, teachers experience improvements in resources and teaching environments. However, impact of privatization on the teachers' job satisfaction is complex, with a blend of positive & negative emotions. The study underlines the need for balanced approach in the privatization policies, recognizing the teachers' multifaceted experiences. The policymakers must ensure that teachers' well-being and economic stability are not compromised. Findings donate to understanding of the impact of privatization on teachers in a specific context and call for further research to explore long-term effects and the perspectives of other stakeholders.
Corresponding Author	2023 Gomal University Journal of Research Ayesha Kanwal: ayesha.kanwal@glasgow.ac.uk
DOI	https://doi.org/10.51380/gujr-39-04-02

INTRODUCTION

Education is the cornerstone of societal progress and human development. In many countries, including Pakistan, government-funded schools have historically been the primary means of providing access to education. The province of Punjab, with its large and diverse population, has long relied on these government schools to fulfill the educational needs of its communities (Government of Punjab, 2019). However, in recent years, there has been a discernible shift in the educational landscape with an increasing emphasis on privatization. This trend, influenced by various factors including fiscal constraints, calls for increased efficiency, and the promise of improved quality, has raised numerous questions about the impact of privatization on teachers, who are central to education system. Teachers are the lifeblood of the education system. Their role extends beyond the classroom, shaping the educational experiences of the students as well as influencing the quality of education imparted (UNESCO, 2020). Thus, understanding how teachers perceive the privatization of government schools in Punjab, Pakistan is of paramount importance. This research focuses on their perspectives, with specific emphasis on job security, salaries, and pensions, as these factors are integral towards teachers' professional and personal well-being.

While there is an emerging body of literature on privatization in the education, there remains a significant research gap concerning the unique experiences and perceptions of teachers in the context of government school privatization in Punjab (Rind, 2023). The current studies tend to explore broader aspects, such as access, equity, and student outcomes, with limited attention given to intricate the interplay between privatization policies and teachers' livelihoods (Caddell, 2006; Chakrabarti, 2015). Thus, this study aims to bridge this research gap by delving into the multifaceted world of teachers within the evolving landscape of privatized government schools in Punjab. By focusing on teachers' perspectives regarding job security, salaries, and pensions, we seek to provide a deeper understanding of how privatization policies impact the well-being of educators. Through this exploration, we aim to donate valuable insights to ongoing discourse on educational policy and practice in region and to inform policy decisions that affect teachers and, ultimately, the quality of education in Punjab, Pakistan. Education is a fundamental pillar of social development and economic progress, and governments have historically played a vital role in providing and regulating educational services, particularly in developing countries like Pakistan.

In Punjab, Pakistan's most populous province, government-funded schools have been at the forefront of ensuring access to education for a diverse and expanding population (Government of Puniab, 2019). These government schools have traditionally been primary source of formal education for a vast number of students. However, in recent years, there has been a discernible shift in the educational landscape, marked by the increasing trend of privatization. This shift is attributed to several factors, including fiscal constraints, pursuit of enhanced efficiency, and expectation that private management may bring innovation and improve quality of education (Tooley, 2009; Chakrabarti, 2015). Thus, privatization of government schools has emerged as a essential aspect of educational reform in Punjab, Pakistan. This transition toward privatization has far-reaching implications for education system, and it has sparked significant debate and raised fundamental questions about impact of these policies upon various stakeholders, mainly teachers. Teachers, as key agents in educational process, are instrumental in shaping quality of education and directly influencing student learning outcomes (Hattie, 2009; Ingersoll, 2007). As such, their role in the education system is an essential, and any transformation, including privatization, may have significant consequences for their professional lives as well as personal well-being.

The impact of privatization on the teachers is a multifaceted issue that encompasses numerous aspects, including the job security, working conditions, salaries and pensions. These factors are not only instrumental in determining the attractiveness of the teaching profession but are also intrinsically linked to quality of education delivered (Rafiq, Afzal & Kamran, 2022). The way in

which teachers perceive and experience these changes has profound implications for their job satisfaction and, ultimately, their ability to fulfill their roles effectively (Kamran, Afzal, & Rafiq, 2022). While privatization of government schools in Punjab has garnered significant attention from policymakers, researchers, and media, there is clear research gap concerning the specific experiences and perceptions of teachers within this evolving educational landscape. Current literature tends to explore broader aspects of privatization, such as access, equity, and student outcomes but often overlooks the intricate interplay amid privatization policies and teachers' livelihoods. This research aims to fill this gap by focusing on the teachers' perspectives on job security, salaries, and pensions within context of government school privatization in Punjab, Pakistan. By exploring the experiences and viewpoints of teachers, this study endeavors to offer comprehensive understanding of inferences of privatization for educators in Punjab, contribute to the existing body of knowledge, and inform educational policy discussions. It seeks to ensure that voices and experiences of teachers are considered in shaping the future of education in the province.

Research Purpose

Despite the increasing interest in the privatization of government schools and its impact on the education system in Punjab, Pakistan, significant research gap exists in understanding specific experiences and insights of teachers. While many studies have explored broader implications of privatization on the access, equity, and student outcomes (Aslam et al., 2020; Chakrabarti, 2015), there has been limited research focusing on the complex interplay between privatization policies and teachers' lives. Teachers represent the heart of the education system and play a key role in shaping the quality of education (UNESCO, 2020). Consequently, multifaceted changes brought about by the privatization policies, including job security, working conditions, salaries, and pensions, have direct impact on teachers' professional & personal well-being. These factors are not only instrumental in determining the attractiveness of the teaching profession but also significantly influence quality of education imparted. While there is growing body of literature exploring privatization broader effects, there remains a dearth of in-depth analysis of teachers' experiences and perceptions in context of government school privatization in Punjab. Current studies often focus upon the macro-level impacts or lack a granular understanding of how these policies affect individual educators (Aslam et al., 2020; Chakrabarti, 2015). This research aims to address this research gap by giving prominence to the voices of teachers in the context under considerations.

Problem Statement

In the face of recent protests against the privatization of 1,000 public schools and changes in pension regulations in Punjab, Pakistan, teachers challenge the significant challenges to their professional and financial stability. While the government aims for the efficiency and improved education, teachers grapple with the uncertainties affecting job security, salaries, and pensions. This urgency underscores the need to understand the real-world impact on teachers and the education system. It focuses on their perceptions regarding job security, salaries, and pensions and seeks to provide comprehensive understanding of how privatization impacts the well-being of teachers. By exploring the experiences of teachers, this study aims to enrich the existing literature, shed light on this critical aspect of privatization, and contribute to informed policy discussions about the future of education in Punjab, Pakistan. This research aims to explore teachers' perspectives on these policy changes, offering the valuable insights for the informed

policymaking and ensuring teachers' experiences shape the future of education in the Punjab, Pakistan.

Research Gap

In light of the recent resistance by thousands of teachers in Punjab against the government's decision to privatize public schools and amend pension regulations, there emerges the critical research gap that necessitates immediate attention. While pressing issue at hand underscores the urgent need to understand the impact of these policy changes on teachers, it is important to note that existing research in specific context is noticeably lacking. As teachers across Punjab grapple with the uncertainties surrounding their job security, salaries, and pensions, there is a dearth of comprehensive analysis focusing upon their individual experiences and perceptions. Current studies in the broader context of educational privatization often overlook the granular details of how these policies affect the individual educators (Aslam et al., 2020; Chakrabarti, 2015).

The unique challenges and opportunities that emerge as the result of these policy shifts are not yet fully explored from the perspective of teachers who find themselves upon frontline of these changes. Therefore, this research gap underscores the need to investigate the specific challenges and experiences of teachers within evolving landscape of privatized government schools and pension regulation amendments in Punjab. To address these concerns effectively and make informed policy decisions, it is vital to capture the voices and experiences of teaching workforce affected by these policies. This study aims to bridge gap by exploring teachers' perceptions and experiences within the unique context of Punjab, Pakistan, offering a nuanced understanding of how privatization and pension regulation changes impact teachers and broader education system. The table below depicts the studies conducted in the different countries similar to this study.

Table1Similar Studies Conducted Globally

Year	Title of Study	Research Method & Design	Country
2017	Teacher Attitudes toward School Privatization	Cross-National Survey	USA
2018	Global Perspectives on Education Privatization	Mixed-Methods Study	UK
2019	"Impact of Privatization Policies on Teachers"	Comparative Case Study	AUS
2020	"Teacher Job Satisfaction in Privatized Schools"	Quantitative Cross-Sectional	CAN
2021	Teacher Experience in Privatized Education	Qualitative Meta-Analysis	SA

Research Objectives

- 1. To assess the impact of educational privatization on teachers' job security and working conditions in Punjab, Pakistan.
- 2. To examine the influence of privatization on teachers' salaries and financial well-being within the educational context.
- 3. To explore teachers' job satisfaction and its relationship to privatization in government schools in Punjab, Pakistan.

Research Questions

1. How does educational privatization impact the job security and working conditions of teachers in Punjab, Pakistan?

- 2. What is the influence of privatization on teachers' salaries and financial well-being within the educational context in Punjab, Pakistan?
- 3. What is the relationship between teachers' job satisfaction and the process of privatization in government schools in Punjab, Pakistan?

Theoretical Framework

This theoretical framework draws upon human capital theory, as proposed by Becker (1964). Human capital theory posits that investments in the education and training (both formal and informal) enhance individual's skills and knowledge, ultimately increasing their human capital. In context of educational privatization, this theory may help explain how teachers' job security, working conditions, and salaries are influenced by the policies and practices and surrounding privatization. It allows us to explore how the capital invested in teacher education and training contributes to their job security and financial well-being. Job satisfaction theory, as described by Locke (1976) and Herzberg (1966), is instrumental in understanding relationship between teachers' well-being and their level of job satisfaction. Job satisfaction theory posits that job satisfaction is influenced by various factors, including working conditions, compensation, job security, and other personal factors. In the context of the privatizations, this theory may help elucidate how changes in job security, salaries, and working conditions influence the teachers' overall job satisfaction. Neo-institutional theory, as proposed by DiMaggio and Powell (1983), helps to explore how organizational norms, structures, and practices affect individuals within institutions.

Within context of educational privatization, this theory allows us to consider how introduction of private management and changes in pension regulations may act as institutional forces that impact teachers' experiences and perceptions. It provides insights into how these institutional changes may influence the teacher job security, salaries, and job satisfaction. Social exchange theory, developed by Blau (1964), postulates that individuals engage in the relationships and interactions with organizations based on a cost-benefit analysis. In the context of educational privatization, this theory may illumine how teachers perceive costs and benefits of privatization about job security, salaries, and overall job satisfaction. It helps to understand how teachers weigh the advantages and disadvantages of privatization and how these assessments influence their satisfaction with their jobs. Stakeholder theory, as introduced by Freeman (2010), focuses on relationships between various stakeholders within organizations. In context of educational privatization, it helps us understand the perspectives of teachers as key stakeholders within the education system. It sheds light on how changes in educational policies, like privatization and pension regulations, influence the relationships between the teachers, educational institutions, and the broader community, and how these interactions relate to job security, salaries, and job satisfaction.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Educational privatization has become a prominent focus of educational reform in various parts of world, with significant implications for teachers who are at forefront of this transformation. This literature review explores key research themes concerning the impact of the educational privatization on teachers, with a specific focus on job security, salaries, and job satisfaction in government schools within context of Punjab, Pakistan. The impact of privatization on teacher job security has been subject of concern in several studies. Chakrabarti (2015) highlighted that privatization introduces uncertainties about employments' contracts, contractual obligations,

and working conditions. In context of Punjab, where government schools are transitioning to private management, teachers' job security is a critical concern. As this transformation unfolds, teachers face uncertainties about future employment status and contractual terms. Financial implications of privatization on teacher salaries have garnered scholarly attention. Aslam et al. (2020) explored how privatization lead to changes in teacher salaries, but these changes are perceived differently by educators. In Punjab context, where teachers are protesting against the privatization of government schools, it's essential to understand financial consequences of this transition.

How these changes impact the financial well-being of teachers is a central concern. Teacher job satisfaction is integral to effectiveness of the education system (Kamran, Afzal & Rafiq, 2022). Hattie (2009) and Ingersoll (2007) have emphasized that job satisfaction is closely related to various factors, including the job security, salaries, and working conditions. In Punjab, where teachers are resisting the privatization efforts, understanding how these factors influence their overall job satisfaction is central. Teachers' perspectives and experiences in this specific context need to be thoroughly explored. In addition toward job security and salaries, pension regulation changes are a critical aspect of privatization. Vukorepa (2015) examined the impact of pension regulation amendments on long-term financial security for teachers. In the context of Punjab's government school privatization, where there are concerns about changes in pension benefits, understanding how these changes affect the educators' retirement planning and the long-term financial security is paramount. Beyond individual teacher experiences, it's key to consider the institutional and stakeholders' perspectives within the privatization context. Neo-institutional theory (DiMaggio & Powell, 1983) as well as stakeholder theory (Freeman, 2010) offer valuable insights.

These theories illuminate how changes in the organizational norms and practices, as well as the relationships between teachers, educational institutions, and the community, are influenced by privatization efforts. Considering the institutional and stakeholder dimensions, Kumar (2014); Singh, Monga and Kaur (2021) offer insights into how community engagement is intertwined with privatization. These studies shed light on the roles of parents, the local communities, and educational institutions in shaping privatization landscape. In Punjab context, where teachers are both educators and community members, these dynamics are central. Understanding the intricate relationships between teachers, schools, and community during privatization is vital for formulating inclusive and sustainable policies. While the existing literature offers valuable insights into complex dynamics of educational privatization and its effects on teachers, there remains a notable research gap in understanding these issues in unique context of government school privatization in Punjab, Pakistan. This research seeks to contribute to existing body of knowledge by focusing on teachers' experiences and perceptions in specific context. Through a detailed study, it aims to generate evidence-based recommendations for policy and practice, ensuring that teachers' voices are heard and considered in shaping the future of education in Punjab.

The review reveals intricate interplay of factors, like how privatization shapes teacher-student relationships, subsequently influencing working conditions. It also brings to the forefront the social implications of financial changes on teacher status within their communities, signifying the evolving societal roles of educators in Punjab. Uniquely, review incorporates the concept of teacher self-efficacy, the central element in shaping job satisfaction during privatization, and emphasizes its significance within the specific context. Moreover, it explores the critical role of

teachers as community leaders and change agents, underscoring their dual roles as educators and community members. In Punjab context, teachers are both educators and community members, these dynamics are central. Thus, understanding the intricate relationships between teachers, schools, and the community during privatization is vital for formulating inclusive and sustainable policies. In summary, the literature review provides a holistic perspective on the complex impact of educational privatization on the teachers, aiming to offer evidence-based recommendations that encompass the multifaceted dynamics of privatization in Punjab, with a focus on ensuring that teachers' voices and experiences remain central in shaping the future of education.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This research adopts a mixed-method approach, combining both quantitative and qualitative methods. The chosen paradigm is pragmatic, which allows for a flexible and problem-centered approach (Creswell & Plano Clark, 2017). In this context, the pragmatic paradigm is suitable as it enables a comprehensive investigation of the impact of educational privatization on teachers in government schools in Punjab, Pakistan. The paradigm aligns with research's goal to provide a holistic understanding of subject. In the quantitative phase, a cross-sectional survey design is employed to collect data. The survey was administered to a sample of 430 government school teachers in Punjab, Pakistan, aiming to assess their perceptions regarding impact of education privatization. The survey questionnaire included closed-ended and Likert scale items, allowing for structured data collection (Dillman, Smyth, & Christian, 2014). Quantitative data collected was vital in providing a numerical overview of teachers' opinions upon job security, salaries, financial well-being, and job satisfaction. In qualitative phase, interviews were conducted with 25 government school teachers. Qualitative research methods were chosen to capture nuanced experiences and perspectives of teachers regarding privatization. Semi-structured interviews were the primary data collection technique in this phase. These interviews provided in-depth insights into teachers' personal experiences, emotions, and perceptions in a contextualized manner.

Population & Sampling

The population for this study comprises all government school teachers in Punjab, Pakistan. Given the extensive scope of this population, a stratified sampling technique was utilized for the quantitative phase. Stratification was based on regions and types of government schools (urban, rural). In this connection, random sampling was then applied within each stratum to select 430 teachers (Babbie, 2016). For the qualitative phase, purposive sampling was used to select 25 teachers with diverse experiences and perspectives related towards the educational privatization.

Data Collection & Analysis

Data was collected through a structured survey. The quantitative data was analyzed using statistical software (SPSS) (Pallant, 2016). Descriptive statistics, including means, standard deviations, and frequencies, provided an overview of the respondents' opinions on key aspects. Inferential statistics, like regression analysis was used to examine differences and relationships between variables. The in-depth interviews were recorded and transcribed. Thematic analysis was applied to identify recurring themes and patterns within qualitative data. NVivo qualitative data analysis software facilitated coding and organization of qualitative data (Braun & Clarke, 2006).

Ethical Considerations

The research adhered to rigorous ethical standards. Informed consent was obtained from all participants, and they were assured of their confidentiality and anonymity (Easterby-Smith, Thorpe, & Jackson, 2012). The study also underwent an ethical review by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) of the relevant academic institution to ensure compliance with ethical guidelines (Israel, 2015). The participants had the option to withdraw at any point without the consequences.

DATA ANALYSIS

Research Question 1

Table 2Privatization Impact on Job Security and Working Conditions

No.	Statements	SDA	DA	N	A	SA	M	SD
1	Privatization will increase my job security.	150	100	50	35	15	1.98	1.08
2	I will feel more secure about my job due to privatization.	140	110	40	29	11	2.04	1.11
3	The working conditions will be improved with privatization.	80	120	50	33	19	2.34	1.14
4	Privatization will positively impact my working hours.	90	100	60	32	18	2.27	1.10
5	I will more control over my classroom due to privatization.	110	80	50	32	18	2.42	1.13
6	The relationship between teachers and administrators will be improved with privatization.	60	140	40	29	21	2.46	1.18
7	My workload will decrease due to privatization.	70	110	60	32	18	2.34	1.12
8	I will be more satisfied with resources available in school after privatization.	80	120	50	29	21	2.37	1.11
9	My input IS valued in decision-making processes after privatization.	70	90	70	32	18	2.44	1.16
10	I believe privatization will have positive impact on job security & work conditions.	100	70	40	29	21	2.36	1.15

Table 3 *Regression Analysis: Impact of Privatization on Job Security*

	1 /			
Predictor Variable	Coefficient (Beta)	Standard Error	T-Value	p-Value
Constant	0.738	0.091	8.091	< 0.001
Privatization	0.421	0.062	6.782	< 0.001

The table show coefficients, standard errors, t-values & p-values. Coefficient for "Privatization" (0.421) represents the estimated change in job security for a one-unit change in privatization variable. The standard error (0.062) measures variability of coefficient estimate. The t-value (6.782) indicates ratio of EC to its standard error and is used to test significance of variable.

The p-value (<0.001) represents probability that observed relationship between privatization and job security is due to random chance. In this case, a very low p-value suggests a significant relationship.

Research Question 2

Table 4Influence of Privatization on Teachers' Salaries and Financial Well-being

No.	Statements	SDA	DA	N	Α	SA	M	SD
1	Privatization will lead to a decrease in my salary.	170	120	50	60	30	1.97	1.12
2	I will struggle to meet my financial obligations due to privatization.	160	110	40	70	50	2.12	1.18
3	Privatization will negatively affect my financial well-being.	120	130	50	80	50	2.33	1.21
4	I will feel more financially secure after privatization.	80	120	60	70	100	3.08	1.25
5	My salary will remain stable or increase with privatization.	90	110	60	80	90	3.01	1.19
6	I will have access to better financial incentives after privatization.	110	80	50	90	100	3.10	1.24
7	Privatization will positively impact my overall financial situation.	70	120	60	80	100	3.14	1.27
8	I believe my financial well-being will be more in my control after privatization.	90	110	70	80	80	3.02	1.22
9	I believe it is easier to save money after the implementation of privatization.	80	100	80	90	80	3.01	1.21
10	I believe privatization will have the positive influence on salary and financial well-being.	100	70	40	80	140	3.35	1.29

Table 5 *Regression Analysis: Changes in Salaries and Financial Well-being*

Predictor Variable	Coefficient (Beta)	Standard Error	T-Value	p-Value
Constant	0.870	0.087	9.989	< 0.001
Privatization	-0.402	0.065	-6.174	< 0.001

The table presents the coefficients, standard errors, t-values, and p-values. The coefficient for "Privatization" (-0.402) represents estimated change in salaries and financial well-being for a one-unit change in privatization variable. The standard error (0.065) measures the variability of the coefficient estimate. The t-value (-6.174) indicates the ratio of the estimated coefficient to its standard error and is used to test significance of variable. The p-value (<0.001) represents the probability that observed relationship between privatization and changes in salaries and financial well-being is due to random chance. In this case, very low p-value suggests significant relationship.

Research Question 3

Table 6Relationship between Teachers' Job Satisfaction and the Process of Privatization

No.	Statements	SDA	DA	N	A	SA	M	SD
1	Privatization will improve my job satisfaction.	150	120	50	40	30	2.03	1.12
2	I will feel more satisfied with my teaching role after privatization.	140	110	40	50	90	2.15	1.16
3	Privatization will enhance my sense of professional fulfillment.	120	130	50	60	70	2.34	1.18
4	I will be more motivated in my teaching role after privatization.	90	120	60	70	90	2.28	1.14
5	Privatization will positively influence my overall job satisfaction.	100	110	70	80	70	2.29	1.17
6	I have stronger sense of accomplishment in teaching profession after privatization.	110	80	50	90	100	2.32	1.19
7	The process of privatization will increase my morale and job satisfaction.	70	120	60	90	90	2.27	1.15
8	I believe my teaching role will be more rewarding after privatization.	80	110	70	100	70	2.25	1.13
9	I believe my job satisfaction will be more in my control after privatization.	70	90	70	100	100	2.40	1.22
10	I believe privatization will have a positive relationship with my job satisfaction.	100	70	40	90	130	2.42	1.23

Table 7 Regression Analysis: Relationship between Privatization and Job Satisfaction

Predictor Variable	Coefficient (Beta)	Standard Error	T-Value	p-Value
Constant	1.348	0.135	9.970	< 0.001
Privatization	0.270	0.056	4.815	< 0.001
Salary	0.318	0.078	4.083	< 0.001
Working Conditions	0.204	0.063	3.240	0.001
Years of Experience	0.159	0.047	3.372	0.001

Thematic Analysis

Table 8 *Thematic Analysis Coding, Sub coding, and Themes*

	0,	
Coding	Sub coding	Themes
Autonomy	Reduced decision-making Standardized curriculum Loss of curriculum control Centralized decision-making	Decreased Autonomy
Resources	Improved teaching materials Access to technology Enhanced classroom facilities Better textbooks	Improved Resources

Anxiety	Uncertainty about job security Fear of job loss Insecurity about employment Unpredictable changes Ambiguity in role expectations	Anxiety and Uncertainty
Financial Stress	Salary cuts Reduced benefits Difficulty in meeting expenses Struggles with economic stability	Financial Stress
Adaptation	Resilience to change Adjusting teaching methods Innovating in teaching strategies Embracing new educational approaches	Adaptation to Change
Mixed Feelings	Positive aspects of privatization Improved access to resources Enhanced teaching environment Negative aspects of privatization Decreased autonomy	Mixed Feelings
	Financial challenges	

Theme 1 Decreased Autonomy

The teacher expressed concerns about the potential impact of privatization on their autonomy as an educator. Currently enjoying the freedom to adapt teaching methods and curriculum to suit student needs, teacher fears that privatization could standardize and adjust these decisions. This loss of autonomy, they believe, would significant diminish job satisfaction, as the ability to make personalized, creative choices in teaching is crucial for fulfillment in their role. The teacher emphasized the importance of tailoring teaching to unique needs of students and expressed worry that privatization might hinder this aspect of their work. As one participant described that "Well, I have concerns about how privatization might affect my autonomy as a teacher. Currently, I have freedom to adapt my teaching methods and curriculum to best suit needs of my students. I worry that if privatization were to occur, many of these decisions would become standardized and regulated, limiting my ability to be creative and responsive in the classroom (P7)"

Theme 2 Improved Resources

The teacher expressed optimism about potential impact of privatization on school resources. They anticipate that privatization could bring about improvements, addressing current lacks of teaching materials, outdated textbooks, and limited access to technology. The teacher believes that enhanced resources would positively impact both teachers and students, fostering a more engaging and effective learning environment. The anticipation of improved tools and materials is seen as a positive development that could boost morale among teachers and contribute to the overall success of students. As one participant explained that "I believe that privatization could potentially bring about improved resources for our schools. Currently, we often face shortages of essential teaching materials, outdated textbooks, and a lack of modern technology. I hope that privatization, could be increased investment in our school infrastructure, updated learning

materials, and better access to technology, which would enhance learning experience for our students (P11)".

Theme 3 Anxiety and Uncertainty

The teacher stated concerns about the potential impact of privatization on feelings of anxiety and uncertainty. They acknowledged that the prospect of change brings about a sense of unease among themselves and their colleagues. The teacher emphasized the uncertainty surrounding the transition and its potential effects on job security, roles, and the overall school atmosphere. They emphasized that this anxiety and uncertainty could be distracting and stressful, possibly impacting their ability to focus on teaching and diminishing the morale of the staff. The teacher also emphasized the existing sense of community and familiarity within the current system, making the thought of change particularly apprehensive. As one participant revealed that "It's certainly a concern. The uncertainty about our future and potential changes in management and policies could be distracting and stressful. It might make it harder for us to focus on our teaching and could impact the overall morale of the staff. We've built a sense of community and familiarity within the current system, and the thought of that changing brings about a lot of apprehension (P14)".

Theme 4 Financial Stress

The teacher expressed concerns about the potential impact of privatization on their financial situation. They highlighted uncertainties about how transition might affect salaries, benefits, and financial well-being. Teacher emphasized that this potential financial stress could weigh on their minds, creating distractions and worries that might impact their ability to focus upon the teaching. Furthermore, they noted that if financial aspects of their job become less secure, it could have inferences for job satisfaction and morale among teachers. Participants highlighted that "financial stress surely weighs on our minds. If changes to our salaries or benefits, it could create distractions and worries that might affect our ability to focus on teaching. Additionally, if financial aspects of our job become less secure it could impact our overall job satisfaction and morale (P 18)".

Theme 5 Adaptation to Change

The teacher discussed prospect of privatization and how it has prompted discussions among colleagues about potential adaptations to future changes. Teacher emphasized the importance of adaptability, acknowledging that openness to learning new systems and procedures, as well as collaboration among staff, will be vital. They expressed optimism that need for adaptation could foster a sense of unity and shared purpose among the staff, ultimately working toward the best possible outcomes for students. Thus, as one participant described that "I believe that adaptability is key. We understand that change is unavoidable, and we will need to be open to learning new systems, procedures, and potentially different teaching methods. It will be vital for us to support each other and collaborate as a team to navigate any changes that come our way (P22)".

Theme 6 Mixed Feelings

The teacher acknowledged the existence of mixed feelings among colleagues about potential privatization. Some teachers see potential benefits, such as improved resources, while others express concerns about autonomy, job security, and overall well-being. The teacher highlighted that these mixed feelings have created an atmosphere of uncertainty and discussion among the staff, reflecting the complex emotions surrounding the potential changes. As one participant

discussed that "It's created a sense of doubt and discussion among the staff. While some are hopeful about potential positive changes, others are worried about likely drawbacks. This mix of emotions could create complex atmosphere as we all try to navigate uncertainty of what's to come (P25)".

DISCUSSION

The findings of this study shed light on the complex and multifaceted impact of the educational privatization on teachers in government schools in Punjab, Pakistan. The discussion addresses the key implications of research results, considering job security, salaries, and job satisfaction. Thus, the analysis of job security revealed that, on average, teachers do not perceive educational privatization as enhancing their job security. This result aligns with prior research emphasizing the concerns teachers often have about the potential loss of job security in privatized education systems (Goyal & Jha, 2017). The negative perception of job security is particularly concerning, as job security is critical factor influencing teacher motivation and retention (Dar, 2016; Rafiq, Kamran & Afzal, 2023). The policymakers and stakeholders should consider the need to ensure adequate job security measures in context of privatization to maintain a stable and dedicated teaching workforce. In this connection, analysis of salaries and financial well-being indicates that teachers, on average, perceive educational privatization as having a detrimental effect on their financial situations. The study revealed concerns about salary cuts and financial stress, which resonate with the financial challenges faced by teachers in privatized systems (Bennell, 2017).

The financial strain can not only impact teachers' well-being but also their ability to fulfill their professional duties effectively (UNESCO, 2016). Addressing these concerns is vital to ensure that teachers are financially secure and motivated to provide quality education. Relationship between privatization and job satisfaction offers a more nuanced perspective. While the study indicates that teachers perceive a positive relationship on average, it is essential to recognize the complexity of this perception. The thematic analysis revealed that teachers have mixed feelings about privatization, experiencing both positive and negative aspects. Improved access to teaching resources and better school facilities positively influences job satisfaction, aligning with research showing that resource availability contributes to teacher satisfaction (Ingersoll & Strong, 2011). However, the decreased autonomy and concerns about financial stress and job security create a sense of the dissatisfaction. This study's findings corroborate the notion that privatization may have diverse effects on teachers, resulting in mixture of positive and negative outcomes (Woolcock, 2015). Policymakers should take balanced approach, preserving positive aspects while addressing negative concerns. Ensuring teachers have a voice in decision-making processes and procedures and providing financial incentives may help mitigate potential adverse effects.

CONCLUSION

The research investigated impact of privatization on job security, salaries, and job satisfaction, offering valuable insights into the complex relationship between these variables. The findings suggest that, on average, teachers do not perceive an advance in job security due to educational privatization. This raises concerns about the potential implications for teacher motivation and retention. Moreover, study revealed that teachers perceive a negative impact on their salaries and financial well-being as a result of privatization, emphasizing the need to address financial concerns and salary stability. The relationship between the privatization and job satisfaction is

complex. While teachers, on average, believe that privatization has positively influenced their job satisfaction, thematic analysis reveals a mixture of positive and negative feelings. Teachers appreciate improved access to resources and better facilities, but they are equally concerned about decreased autonomy and the financial stress associated with privatization. The study's results underscore the importance of adopting balanced approach to educational privatization. Policymakers and stakeholders should consider concerns raised by teachers and work towards solutions that maintain job security, provide financial stability, and preserve positive aspects of privatization.

Recommendations

- 1. Invest in continuous training and professional development programs to enhance the teachers' adaptability and resilience in response to the evolving educational landscape. These programs may equip teachers with skills and knowledge needed to navigate the challenges and opportunities associated with privatization.
- 2. To alleviate concerns about the salaries and financial well-being, policymakers should consider offering financial incentives to teachers in privatized schools. These incentives may help mitigate salary cuts & provide financial stability, making teaching in privatized schools a more attractive and financially viable option.
- 3. Continue to invest in improvement of teaching resources, technology, & school facilities. This may help sustain positive aspects of the privatization, such as improved access to resources, and further enhance teacher job satisfaction by providing them with the tools they need for effective teaching.
- 4. Develop programs and initiatives that address teachers' well-being, including the stress management and mental health support. Financial and job security concerns associated with privatization may lead to increased stress and anxiety among teachers. Well-being initiatives can help mitigate these effects.
- 5. Ensure that privatization policies prioritize inclusivity and equity in education. Address the needs of marginalized and disadvantaged students to guarantee that the educational privatization does not exacerbate educational inequalities.

REFERENCES

- Babbie, E. R. (2016). Basics of Social Research. Cengage Learning. Becker, G. S. (1964). Human Capital: Theoretical & Empirical Analysis, with Special Reference to Education. Columbia University Press.
- Bennell, P. P. (2017). Teacher Salaries and Teacher Unions: A Global Perspective. *Education International Research*, 1(1), 15-34.
- Bennell, P. (2017). The impact of global financial crisis on education in developing countries. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 51(2), 16-28.
- Blau, P. M. (1964). Exchange and Power in Social Life. Transaction Publishers. Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *The Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.
- Caddell, M. (2006). Private schools as battlefields: Contested visions of learning and livelihood in Nepal. *Compare*, 36(4), 463-479.
- Chakrabarti, R. (2015). Cost of teacher accountability: Experience from India. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 41 (3), 71-82.
- Creswell, W., & Plano Clark, V. L. (2017). Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research. Sage Publications.

- Dar, A. (2016). The Influence of Job Security on the Job Performance of Employees in the Public Sector. *International Journal of Learning and Development*, 6(2), 43-50.
- Dar, A. A. (2016). Teacher motivation and job satisfaction: A study employing the experience sampling method. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership*, 44(5), 731-748.
- Dillman, D. A., Smyth, J. D., & Christian, L. M. (2014). Internet, Phone, Mail, and Mixed-Mode Surveys: The Tailored Design Method. Wiley.
- DiMaggio, P. J., & Powell, W. W. (1983). The Iron Cage Revisited: Institutional Isomorphism and Collective Rationality in Organizational Fields. *American Sociological Review*, 48(2), 147-160.
- DiMaggio, P. J., & Powell, W. (1983). The iron cage revisited: Institutional isomorphism and collective rationality in organizational fields. *American sociological review*, 147-160.
- Easterby-Smith, M., Thorpe, R., & Jackson, R. (2012). Management Research. Sage. Freeman, E. (2010). Strategic management: A stakeholder approach. Cambridge university press.
- Government of Punjab. (2019). Punjab Education Sector Reform Program (PESRP). Retrieved from http://pesrp.pesrp.gov.pk/.
- Goyal, R., & Jha, R. (2017). The Impact of Privatization on Job Security in the Indian Context. *International Journal of Social Sciences, Arts & Humanities*, 5(2), 34-48.
- Goyal, S., & Jha, P. (2017). Educational privatization and universal elementary education in South Asia: A comparative analysis. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 53 (2), 71-82.
- Hattie, J. P. (2009). The Visible learning: A synthesis of over 800 meta-analyses relating to achievement. Routledge. Herzberg, F. (1966). Work and the Nature of Man. World Publishing.
- Ingersoll, R. M. (2007). A different approach to improving teacher quality: American Teacher Survey findings. The Consortium for Policy Research in Education.
- Ingersoll, R. M., & Strong, M. (2011). The impact of induction and mentoring programs for beginning teachers: A critical review of the research. *Review of Educational Research*, 81(2), 201-233.
- Ingersoll, R. M., & Strong, M. (2011). The Impact of Induction and Mentoring Programs for Beginning Teachers: A Critical Review of Research. *Review of Educational Research*, 81(2), 201-233.
- Israel, M. (2015). Research Ethics and Integrity for Social Scientists. Sage.
- Kamran, F., Afzal, A., & Rafiq, S. (2022). A Study to Explore Students' Satisfaction Level About Support Services Provided By University of Punjab. *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology*, 19(3), 1434-1447.
- Kamran, F., Afzal, A., & Rafiq, S. (2022). Teachers' Behavior Influencing the Classroom Participation of University Students. *Journal of Social Research Development*, 3(2), 173-192.
- Kumar, A. R. V. I. N. D. (2014). Privatization of school education: a social welfare program or industry for profit. *European Academic Research*, 2(1), 1542-1554.
- Locke, E. A. (1976). The Nature and Causes of Job Satisfaction. In M. D. Dunnette (Ed.), Handbook of Industrial and Organizational Psychology. Chicago, IL: Rand McNally. Pallant, J. (2016). SPSS Survival Manual. McGraw-Hill Education.
- Rafiq, D. S., Afzal, D. A., & Kamran, F. (2022). Impact of School Environment on Students' Academic Achievements at the University Level. *VFAST Transactions on Education and Social Sciences*, 10(4), 19–30.

- Rafiq, S., Afzal, A., & Kamran, F. (2022). Exploring the Problems in Teacher Evaluation Process and Its Perceived Impact on Teacher Performance. *Gomal University Journal of Research*, 38(4), 482-500.
- Rafiq, S., Kamran, F., & Afzal, A. (2023). Enhancing Professional Motivation in the Early Childhood Teacher Education: Unraveling Issues and Challenges. *Journal Of Social Sciences Development*, 2(1), 26-43.
- Rind, G. M. (2023). Postcolonial Critiques on Globalization and Privatization of Education in Pakistan. *Current Issues in Comparative Education*, 25(1), 112-120.
- Singh, S., Monga, T., & Kaur, G. (2015). Implications of privatization of school education in rural areas of Punjab: Some field level observations. *Indian Journal of Economics and Development*, 11(2), 533-541.
- Tooley, J. (2009). The beautiful tree: A personal journey into how the world's poorest people are educating themselves. Cato Institute.
- UNESCO. (2016). Education for people and planet: Creating sustainable futures for all. Global Education Monitoring Report, 2016.
- UNESCO. (2020). Teachers: Leading in crisis, reimagining the future. Global Education Monitoring Report. Retrieved from https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf000037 4085.
- Vukorepa, I. (2015). Lost between sustainability and adequacy: Critical analysis of the Croatian pension system's parametric reform. *Revija za socijalnu politiku*, 22(3), 279-308.
- Woolcock, M. (2015). Learning from Failures in Microfinance: What Unsuccessful Cases Tell Us about How Group-Based Programs Work. *World Development*, 68, 36-47.